

which is most readily related to the occasions for which given works were composed. Nonetheless, it is quite rare for such numbers to confirm a specific occasion as clearly as do those, say, in the case of *Nuper rosarum flores*. It may simply be, at a deeper level, that analysis in general is not necessarily pertinent or illuminating in terms of Nosow's thesis. A final point—not so much a criticism of a fine book as an observation—is how striking it is, given the near-instant obsolescence of a fair proportion of the motet repertory, how many were disseminated nonetheless, and how far afield of their places of origin. Whereas musicology seems very preoccupied with locating those origins (what one might call the 'genetic' principle—how works came to be), the afterlives of motets, which began in some cases at the moment they first ceased to sound, and of which their subsequent dissemination is a trace, is equally worthy of discussion. But that is a matter for other studies.

doi:10.1093/em/cas137

Tess Knighton

From Madrid to Mexico

Tomás Luis de Victoria y la cultura musical en la España de Felipe III, ed. Alfonso de Vicente and Pilar Tomás (Madrid: Centro de Estudios Europa Hispánica / Machado Libros, 2012), €38.46

Javier Marín López, Los libros de polifonía de la Catedral de México. Estudio y catálogo crítico (Madrid: Sociedad Española de Musicología / Universidad de Jaén, 2012), €70

The Victoria anniversary year in 2011 has resulted—as such anniversaries often happily do—in a flurry of activity in terms of publications, recordings and conferences. Serendipitously, the Early Music Award at the 2012 *Gramophone* awards ceremony went to Michael Noone's Ensemble Plus Ultra for their ten superb Archiv CDs dedicated to Victoria's music. Although I know of at least two more volumes of essays to come, this collection edited by Alfonso de Vicente and Pilar Tomás will surely be the most *de luxe*: it is beautifully produced, with a high density of colour illustrations (mostly of excellent quality), and a weight and finish of paper that readers of earlier editions of *Early Music* will recognize and savour. Kindles are all very well, but this tome is a material object worth reckoning with. I would also mention that the standard of

editing is excellent: elegant (almost without a typographical error in sight), and with useful indexes, making it a book you can judge by its beautiful, full-colour El Greco cover. Vicente and Tomás have commissioned essays from twelve of the leading experts on music and culture in the reign of Philip III (1598–1621), when Victoria was resident in Madrid, until his death in 1611.

Two of the essays are not by music historians: Fernando Negro del Cerro is a cultural historian whose research has focused largely on the art of rhetoric in the sermons preached in the royal chapel, and Roberto Quirós Rosado is a historian whose essay on the mercantile interests of the Luis and Victoria dynasties from Ávila provides a fascinating insight into the composer's family background. So it turns out that the composer's surname was in fact Luis de Victoria and in this volume he is scrupulously indexed under 'L': future dictionary compilers will want to take note, but I will continue to refer to him as Victoria (for short) in this review. Less clear is whether his ancestors were Jewish *conversos*, but more important than either of these details is the existence of an established family trade network with interests in Italy and the New World as well as with an important stake in royal finances that afforded close connections at court. This family background helps to explain the composer's apparent willingness to enter into the publication and distribution of not only his own works, but also those by contemporaries such as Philippe Rogier and Alonso Lobo. Victoria was clearly the driving force behind the establishment of the music-printing activities of the Imprenta Real in Madrid, which functioned at first quite smoothly, producing about one major edition—whether in choirbook or partbook format—a year, but less well following the relocation of the court to Valladolid in the early years of the 17th century. Although Victoria's volume of funeral music for the royal exequies of the Empress Maria appeared in 1605, it appears to have been less widely distributed and it marked a hiatus in music publication in Madrid; no further books appeared until well after Victoria's death. Information (almost all of it already known) on Victoria's printing activities is scattered through various essays, and it would have been interesting to have gathered the known facts together and considered them in the broader context of music publishing in Spain around 1600.

The distribution of Victoria's works, however, is very well covered in this volume, and much new information is put forward. The overall picture remains patchy, or at least presents some anomalies. For example, the reception of his music in Portugal in his own lifetime and the years afterwards is curiously limited, at least according to the

data available. Rui Vieira Nery points out that, even though copies of his publications, manuscript sources and inventories that might have listed his music were undoubtedly lost in the terrible earthquake in Lisbon in 1755, João IV (1603–56)—that most music-loving of Portuguese kings—appears to have been relatively little acquainted with Victoria's music. The first part of the index of João IV's extraordinary *Livraria Real de Musica* lists Victoria's 1600 Madrid edition of Masses, motets and Magnificats, but none of his other publications, while in his writings the king barely mentions him: indeed, Vieira Nery points out that João's description of the composer's music as essentially 'alegre' and almost never really sad ('nunca queda muy triste'), raises severe doubts as to his first-hand knowledge of Victoria's volume of music for Holy Week, or his Requiem Mass. Juan Ruiz's magisterial survey of the distribution of Victoria's music, in printed and manuscript form, via the cathedral network would also seem to suggest that his status within the Peninsula was not as exalted as that of Morales or Guerrero, despite his assiduous sending of printed volumes to cathedral chapters for their assessment and subsequent purchase. This picture would appear to have extended also to the New World where, as Javier Marín López equally brilliantly demonstrates through a welter of new documentation, Victoria's music certainly circulated, being copied into manuscripts and even emulated by composers working in Mexico City Cathedral and elsewhere. Yet Palestrina's music was also highly revered; indeed, Italian, and specifically Roman, connections later in the 17th and in the 18th centuries prove to be of particular importance for later patterns of distribution.

Most of the remaining essays are concerned with the spaces and contexts in which Victoria's music was known and performed in his own lifetime: the royal chapel (Luis Robledo Estaire); El Escorial (Gustavo Sánchez); the monastery of the Descalzas Reales where Victoria spent the latter part of his life (Alfonso de Vicente); the city of Valladolid where Philip III set up court while Victoria remained in Madrid (Cristina Diego Pacheco); and the composer's activities and achievements in Rome before he returned to Spain (Noel O'Regan). O'Regan's contribution to our knowledge of Victoria's career in Rome has been outstanding—many of his findings have been presented in *Early Music* over the years—and he continues to find unknown material and offer new insights into how a 16th-century composer of Victoria's standing divided his time and energies. Here his essay is entitled 'A tale of two cities,' with Victoria as a musical mediator between Rome and Madrid, largely responsible for the transmission of the

Roman style—and the polychoral idiom—to Spain. Yet it is still not known whether Victoria's return to Spain in about 1585 was intended as a definitive move, or as a temporary sojourn; he certainly kept up with court activities through other members of his family, but was he really hoping, even expecting, to secure a place in the royal chapel dominated by Flemish singers? As is well known, he did not, but instead spent the remainder of his life at the Convent of Las Descalzas Reales in Madrid, resolutely not travelling to Valladolid with the court in the early years of the 17th century. The brief but insightful surveys in this volume of the two most important musical institutions in Madrid clarify a number of questions that have remained obscure hitherto. Robledo traces the incipient Italianization of music at the court of Philip III, and provides fascinating information on the way in which the king's own musical preference for music for viol consort and for guitar (both instruments he played himself) infiltrated performance practice in the *capilla real*. Vicente provides clear evidence of the musical resources available in the royal convent—a group of all-male singers, and instrumentalists (organ and dulcian only until about the second decade of the 17th century, and then other winds such as cornett and sackbut, as well as, on occasion, harp)—and when extra musicians were recruited. The discussion of the polyphonic repertory of the convent chapel, based on a series of inventories, is also highly illuminating.

In general, these essays offer a great deal on the contexts in which Victoria worked and in which his music was known and performed, but relatively little on the music itself. The reassessment by Emilio Ros-Fábregas of his eponymous 'Pro Victoria' Mass, broadens consideration of the 'battle Mass' to include the longstanding tradition of symbolic association initiated by the *L'homme armé* Masses of the 15th century. He highlights the transition from the emblematic quality of a *cantus firmus* melody to a mimetic polyphonic—and, indeed, polychoral—texture as reflecting the shift from the personal triumph accredited an individual leader, such as the Duke of Burgundy, to victories that could only be achieved as the result of political alliances. Yet even here the emphasis is more on context than text. Nevertheless, this excellent volume does provide new insights on many aspects, and touches tantalizingly on the later reception of Victoria's music in several of the essays, even if the *Rezeptionsgeschichte* is here restricted to the Iberian world.

Javier Marín López does mention the German Cecilian movement in his comprehensive essay on Victoria's music in the New World, and it would be fascinating to chart the extent to which Cecilian reforms and advocacies affected

the Americas. The same painstaking thoroughness of Marín López's approach is still more apparent in his two-volume catalogue of the music library of Mexico City Cathedral, *Los libros de polifonía de la Catedral de México*. Producing catalogues of cathedral music archives has been a longstanding tradition in Spanish musicology in particular, but this contribution to the genre breaks the mould, going well beyond the presentation of a more or (usually) less detailed list of the manuscript and printed musical sources in a single ecclesiastical institution. The enumeration of the 563 works found in the 22 surviving music books (seven of them prints) from Mexico City Cathedral is preceded by an extensive study of the collection that includes codicological information, liturgical function and a detailed analysis of the repertory according to genre. It should be noted that the catalogue is of Latin-texted works corresponding to the *libros de facistol*, or choirbooks: the music originally copied in *papeles sueltos* (separate parts or partbooks), which included hundreds of pieces with vernacular texts (*villancicos* etc.) has been lost, but can be reconstructed in part from the series of inventories of the cathedral music books (1589 to 1927), which are reproduced as Appendix 2 in vol.i, pp.127–49. (See also Marín López's article 'The musical inventory of Mexico Cathedral, 1589: a lost document rediscovered', in *Early Music*, xxxvi (2008), pp.575–96.) Where possible, Marín López has taken this lost repertory into his consideration of the musical repertory of the cathedral as a whole. It is vital to note this skewed pattern of survival of choirbooks over what might be termed sheet music: the combination of the long shelf-life of the canonic 16th-century works with the common use of the *stile antico* by many composers throughout the 17th and 18th centuries in their Latin-texted works lends a distinctly conservative feel to the surviving repertory. The lost vernacular pieces in separate parts would undoubtedly have presented a more balanced picture, with composers adopting and experimenting with more up-to-date styles and techniques.

The catalogue is nevertheless valuable as a snapshot of the Latin musical repertory of a major institution in the New World from its foundation in the first half of the 16th century to the 18th century and beyond. This extended perspective is particularly useful in establishing the canonic repertory of the cathedral—as elsewhere in the Iberian world, late 16th-century polyphony, particularly that of Francisco Guerrero, continued to be copied and performed right through this period, often alongside polychoral or concerted Baroque music—and in identifying local practices and preferences. These could be fairly

major (as in the adherence to the chant melodies of the Toledan tradition) or relatively minor (as, for instance, which verses of the psalms came to be set polyphonically, p.82). Although the mix of music available in Mexico City clearly drew on local, Iberian and international repertoires, both in the printed books that were imported and in the music that circulated in manuscript, the importance of the role of the chapel masters who served at the cathedral is striking. Cycles of hymns, Magnificats, psalms or music for Holy Week were composed by Hernando Franco (1532–85), Francisco López Capillas (c.1615–73) and others, and used as default settings over many years, with certain other works from outside the cathedral's own polyphonic production team finding their own niches, such as Juan Navarro's setting of the motet *Beatus es, et bene tibi erit* which was sung during the procession held on the feast of St Sebastian (p.112). Not since Robert Snow's superb edition of Guatemala Cathedral, Ms.4 (*A New-World collection of polyphony for Holy Week and the Salve service*, Monuments of Renaissance Music 9 (Chicago, 1996)) has an author grappled with the complexities of matching liturgical tradition and function to extant polyphony to the extent found here.

The catalogue itself is similarly comprehensive, and is preceded by a detailed summary of the methodological criteria developed by Marín López in order to make it as complete but as user-friendly as possible (vol.i, pp.157–63). To take just one manuscript, MéxC 9, by way of example: the initial description follows, as the author indicates, the pattern established by the *Census-catalogue of manuscript sources of polyphonic music* (1979–88) to provide a thumbnail sketch of the source as a whole. This is followed by more detailed information on the copyists involved, the dating, its inclusion in the cathedral inventories, its source, in this case the 1585 edition of Victoria's motets, with a list of the surviving copies of it, and the relevant musicological literature. Detailed concordances are given with each piece, as well as incipits for each voice, inscriptions, the layout and folios over which the contents are copied, facsimile and/or modern editions, and even suggested recordings. The text and liturgical function are also noted, and the notes themselves ('Comentarios') are wide-ranging, mentioning other New World sources or inventories, or specific features of the copy of the work, made in this instance in the early years of the 18th century, as well as any other information that might be of use. All of this is supplemented by an impressive sequence of indices (of composers, genres, works, concordances between works in the cathedral collection, of inscriptions, dates, titles and texts, and even

of vocal scoring). The index of sources consulted for the generating of the concordances includes over 700 printed and manuscript books and covers almost 150 pages. All of which reflects the colossal effort that Marín López has invested in a project that will surely prove invaluable for scholars not just of the Iberian musical world but anyone interested in the diffusion of European (musical) culture. It should not be described, however, as a catalogue to end all catalogues, but one to point the way forward for future contributions to the genre, particularly of collections that are not easily accessible to everyone and which present such a fascinating profile.

doi:10.1093/em/cas139

Antonio Cascelli

Performing the Monteverdian self

Mauro Calcagno, *From madrigal to opera: Monteverdi's staging of the self* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2012), \$60 / £41.95

Over the last 40 years, scholars have developed a more dynamic understanding of Monteverdi's music in its contexts and performances, from Denis Arnold's and Nigel Fortune's *The Monteverdi companion* (London, 1968), Gary Tomlinson's *Monteverdi and the end of the Renaissance* (Berkeley, 1987) and Silke Leopold's *Monteverdi: music in transition* (English edn, Oxford, 1990) to John Whenham's and Richard Wistreich's *Cambridge companion to Monteverdi* (Cambridge, 2007) which, 'while centred on Monteverdi's music, seeks to place it in the context of the institutions for which Monteverdi worked and his intellectual, social and religious environment' (p.xiii). Questions arising from the so-called New Musicology have been central to some of the more recent contributions to the literature on Monteverdi. Susan McClary inaugurated research into Monteverdi and gender studies with her 'Constructions of gender in Monteverdi's dramatic music' (*Cambridge Opera Journal*, i (1989), pp.203–23), and in her later book—*Modal subjectivities* (Berkeley, 2004)—she reads 16th-century Italian madrigals as the loci for the self-fashioning of subject and subjectivities. Bonnie Gordon, in *Monteverdi's unruly women* (Cambridge, 2004), examines Monteverdi's music from the point of view of the musical and cultural world of singing and voice in early modern Italy. As she writes

(p.1), hers 'is a book about the embodied female voices, real and imagined, through which music is circulated. It re-hears singing as an embodied activity and argues that when women sang they made themselves into unruly women.' Wendy Heller's *Emblems of eloquence* (Berkeley, 2003), although not exclusively dedicated to Monteverdi's operas, provides an extremely valuable contribution to the understanding of his music in the context of mythology and the cultural industry in early 17th-century Venice, with a focus on the roles of women within the limits of the political institutions of Venice, as reflected in major female characters in the first operas staged in Venice.

More traditional lines of enquiry, but still under the stimulus of the New Musicology, include the monographs by Tim Carter, Massimo Ossi and Ellen Rosand. Carter's *Monteverdi's music theatre* (New Haven, 2002) is the first monograph on Monteverdi's entire corpus of theatrical music, not just his operas, since Anna Amalie Abert's *Claudio Monteverdi und das musikalische Drama* (Lippstadt, 1954). He highlights the emergence of opera through the north Italian courts and the public theatres of Venice, focusing on aspects of genre and performance practice; in particular he discusses the multifaceted modes of productions. Ossi's *Divining the oracle* (Chicago, 2003) proposes a reassessment of the *seconda prattica* using a language that betrays an almost cinematic understanding of Monteverdi's music and deals, among various aspects, with issues of large-scale organization in the fourth and fifth books of madrigals, highlighting what he describes as a new conception of the madrigal book, with madrigals assembled together according to a narrative thread. Rosand's *Monteverdi's last operas* (Berkeley, 2007) offers a thorough investigation of the primary sources relating to *Il ritorno d'Ulisse in patria* and *L'incoronazione di Poppea*, which, together with the lost score of *Le nozze d'Enea*, constitute a Venetian trilogy, with *Le nozze d'Enea* representing the link between the marital love of Ulisse and Penelope and the self-gratifying and physical love of Nero and Poppea. Mauro Calcagno's new book is thus the latest in a series of rich contributions to the fertile research field on Monteverdi's music, laying the foundation for a bridge between gender-orientated studies of Monteverdi and more traditional lines of investigation.

Much of the recent research on Monteverdi has focused on performance—an important aspect of not just his music but that of the 16th- and 17th-century repertory in general (a repertory by now recognized as distant from the 19th-century concept of the 'musical work')—and on subjects, subjectivities and bodies in performance. Calcagno, by contrast, explores the textual conditions for